



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

**MTC Advisory Council
March 11, 2009
Minutes**

Cathy Jackson called the meeting to order at 12:40 p.m. In attendance were members, Paul Cohen, Raphael Durr, Rita Foti, David Grant, Mary Griffin, William Hastings, Richard Hedges, Kathryn Hughes, Sherman Lewis, James McGhee, Eli Naor, Margaret Okuzumi, Michael Pechner, Bob Planthold, and Don Rothblatt.

Staff Report

Ms. Therese Trivedi announced that MTC voted in a new Chair and Vice-Chair. Alameda County Supervisor Scott Haggerty was elected MTC chair, and San Mateo County Supervisor Adrienne Tissier was elected vice chair.

She also reported back on the vice chair's request on how the resolution related to SB 375 passed at the last meeting will be forwarded to the Commission. She indicated that there are various possibilities – for example, it could be through written correspondence or making a presentation at the Committee level. She discussed how to advance this to the Commission with Planning Director, Mr. Doug Kimsey, who requested more information from the committee, such as, does this refer to projects going through the RTP process? T2035 projects have gone through performance evaluation. Going forward, the next RTP is subject to SB 375. Or, does this mean through programs like TLC? Mr. Eli Naor requested that this come back to the Land Use Subcommittee for further clarification, and to invite Mr. Kimsey to the meeting for discussion on the recommendation prior to going to the Commission.

Report from the Minority Citizens Advisory Committee (MCAC); Report from the Elderly and Disabled Advisory Committee (EDAC)

Mr. Raphael Durr stated that their Lifeline Subcommittee gave a recap on their site-visit ride at Sunvalley Mall (the Monument Community Shuttle project). A small bus picks up individuals throughout the neighborhoods to take them to different clinics, etc. The funding will expire in a year, so they were trying to show the importance of that particular route.

He also stated that the High school Internship Committee announced the opening of the application period for the summer of 2009. He encouraged members to reach out to the youth in their communities to apply.

He stated that staff also gave reports on Commission adoption of funding proposals for the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) and the TransLink[®]/Transit-Oriented Development Policy Project.

Mr. David Grant stated that EDAC had discussions on their new pedestrian safety project. They also had a presentation on the ARRA, where there was considerable discussion related to accessibility questions for new construction projects.

Transportation, Land Use and Greenhouse Gases – DRAFT Resources Guide

Mr. Bruce Riordan stated that the comment period for the Draft Resources Guide has been extended until March 31, 2009. Comments have been received from the Bay Area Air Quality Management District, the Bay Conservation and Development Commission and the Association of Bay Area Governments.

He noted that both he and Mr. Chris Brittle, former MTC Planning Director, started this guide about a year ago because a number of cities and other jurisdictions were struggling with how to address transportation and reducing greenhouse gases. He noted that there are 45 strategies contained in the document, including qualitative information about projects that are underway, examples of programs around the country, web links for more information, and a finding on whether each strategy was technically feasible to be implemented in the next five years. He also stated that they did some analysis on potential impacts of cost effectiveness.

Mr. Riordan welcomed the committee members input.

Committee comments include:

- Confusion about the footnote on Table A – Response - cost = low or high
- Table A, number 13: Expand bike facilities – the potential impact is rated low, but a multimodal option may be high. The cost effectiveness is rated low, and one would think it should be high. Answer: There has been a lot of input from the bicycle community, which will show up in the next version. Also, note that the projects are evaluated on an individual basis, so combining them would give better results.
- The state is already aware of pay-as-you-go insurance
- Add an addendum to call out certain multi-modal options and what you might achieve if you combine
- Add the effect of walkable communities.
- The carbon footprint of any element needs to be reflected.
- Consider ferry travel.
- For emission sources – aircraft and ships account for 25% of the emissions, and yet neither the ports nor the airports are mentioned.
- Need to have a state directive from CARB that tells cities that their no-project modeling is no good.
- Looks like there is an error in greenhouse gas for transportation – well over 60%
- Allocate VMT by city
- Page 8, #25, add bus idling
- Include the cost effectiveness of HOV/T lanes
- There is no mention of Travel Demand Management (travel choice is under #32)
- Is business cost savings under Part 5, Climate Adaptation, or is it under SB375 Implementation - consider creating a separate category like Part 6.

- Specific contacts were given for the Ports of Oakland, San Francisco
- Use high speed rail for lowering emissions.
- For “buy local” – how to implement, mandate this

Minutes

The minutes were approved unanimously.

Public Comment

No comment.

Update on MTC’s Economic Recovery Proposal

Mr. Craig Goldblatt provided an update on the economic recovery proposal presented to the Commission in February 2009. He stated that transit and local rehabilitation projects comprise approximately 80 percent of the requested funds in ARRA formula funding. The remaining funds will be directed to complete strategic investments including: the BART-Oakland Airport Connector, freeway performance initiatives, and local safety projects. Note: these projects must meet certain conditions by June 30 or the funds will be redirected to rehabilitation projects.

He stated that the federal deadlines require the local funds to be obligated within one year and half of the transit funds within 180 days; however, the Commission approved a stricter obligation deadline of 90 days for both transit and local road funds. This is to ensure that if any project delivery issues are met, the Commission has significant time to redirect and obligate funds to other projects in the region.

Lastly, he stated that the Commission deferred action on advocacy priorities for non-formula funding until next month to allow further deliberation and obtain a consistent direction for the advocacy of these nationally-competitive funding programs.

Committee comments include:

- The buses going into the airport put out a high amount of emissions, and they are not very accessible. Very supportive of the BART-Oakland Airport connector.
- The Economic Recovery Proposal needs to be reevaluated in terms of what will attract people to live in Oakland
- High speed rail dollars will be political and competitive

Legislative Update

No report, although a handout was provided detailing earmarks in the Bay Area included in H.R. 1105.

Subcommittee Report – Land Use

Mr. Eli Naor updated the committee on the progress of the Land Use Subcommittee. He stated that the committee is focusing on SB375, and have been involved in discussions with Ted Droettboom of the Joint Policy Committee. They are looking at how to transform the mission of this subcommittee into an actionable one.

He stated that they would like to see grant structures that incentivize communities to work together on policies that impact land use and transportation. They need fiscal tools to help

them act more regionally. Larger grants (\$5-\$10 million) would help, although money could be set aside for grass roots planning.

Mr. Naor suggested that the various subcommittees start working together to start formulating policy propositions. He noted that they prepared a recommendation that the Transportation 2035 follow SB375's recommendations, which are in discussions with MTC staff.

Committee comments included:

- Need to focus on what the hallmarks of a successful project are.
- Attend the transportation land use/accessible transportation EDAC subcommittee
- Draft proposal for how regional agencies will address AB25, SB375
- MTC to convene more forums like the SB375 conference
- Need to consider politics and what is politically feasible
- Invite guest speakers to Advisory Council, such as Transform staff, or someone to talk about SMART

Discussion to increase participation with MTC

Ms. Cathy Jackson handed out the committee work plan and asked the committee to consider ways to better engage the interest categories represented on the Council (such as business, environment, labor, etc.) as related to work plan topics.

Ms. Jackson also hopes that they can not only provide presentations to the Commission on the various topics, but also have a clear message about what the committee is doing.

Ms. Jackson stated that she would like to add green jobs under business, and also suggested inviting Bay Area environmental expert, Van Jones, to speak to the Advisory Council, who was recently appointed to work with the Obama Administration. The committee suggested other potential guest speakers, such as Stuart Cohen from Transform, and MTC's Chair, Scott Haggerty, to hear what they have to say as the committee starts to develop their internal recommendations for the Commission.

She also stated that she would like to add climate change and joint work on climate change to the work plan.

Mr. Raphael Durr commented on Caltrans' Disparity Study, which indicated the minority contract percentage has dropped from 13% to .65%. He stated that Caltrans received conditional approval from the Federal Highway Administration to immediately implement its federal fiscal year 2009 Disadvantage Business Enterprise goals and methodology. Staff liaison Trivedi noted that the committee just received an email on this from Denise Rodrigues, and will hear more about it as additional information becomes available from Caltrans. He stated that he has an appointment with Mr. Padilla in Sacramento to find out the status of the disparity study.

In closing, Ms. Jackson suggested that the Advisory Council might sponsor a forum (subject to be determined), with Richard Hedges possibly taking the lead, with help from Margaret Okuzumi. She also suggested that they look at presenting something to the Commissioners at least twice a year.

Other Business/Public Comment/Announcements

There was no other business. The next meeting of the Advisory Council is scheduled for April 8, 2009. The meeting was adjourned at 2:32 p.m.

J:\COMMITTEE\Commission\2009\March 2009\8i_AdvisoryMarchminutes.doc